

**Glasgow City Council****Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community, and Citizen
Engagement City Policy Committee****Report by Director of Community Empowerment and Equalities****Contact: Evelyn O'Donnell Ext: 39901****PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING (PB) UPDATE****Purpose of Report:**

To seek approval for the draft Participatory Budgeting (PB) framework and note progress of the PB pilots.

Recommendations:**The committee is asked to:**

- note the content of the report;
- consider the proposal that a PB Community of Practice oversee the future co-production of the PB Framework, as detailed in the report; and
- recommend approval of the Participatory Budgeting Framework to the City Administration Committee.

Ward No(s): 3, 6, 9 and 16

Citywide: ✓

Local member(s) advised: Yes ✓

consulted: Yes ✓

PLEASE NOTE THE FOLLOWING:

Any Ordnance Survey mapping included within this Report is provided by Glasgow City Council under licence from the Ordnance Survey in order to fulfil its public function to make available Council-held public domain information. Persons viewing this mapping should contact Ordnance Survey Copyright for advice where they wish to licence Ordnance Survey mapping/map data for their own use. The OS web site can be found at <http://www.ordnancesurvey.co.uk> "

If accessing this Report via the Internet, please note that any mapping is for illustrative purposes only and is not true to any marked scale

1.0 Summary

- 1.1 At the Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and Citizens Engagement City Policy Committee on 31st May 2018, it was agreed a city-wide PB working group would be established to oversee the co-production of Glasgow's PB framework.
- 1.2 It was also agreed to develop four Citizens Panels in each of the Pilot Wards to focus on the poverty and inequality within each Ward.
- 1.3 This report provides an update on progress with the draft PB framework.

2.0 Glasgow's Participatory Budgeting (PB) Framework

- 2.1 The PB Working Group met three times in May, August and October 2018 to agree the ambitions, principles and overarching aim of PB for Glasgow.
- 2.2 A copy of the draft framework is attached as appendix 1.

3.0 PB pilots update

- 3.1 A high level of community engagement was carried out throughout the summer to inform residents of the plans to develop PB in Glasgow. Staff from the anchor organisations attended a wide range of gala days and local events, promoting interest in PB through activities, colourful banners, raffles, information and social media. Calton W9 made a 'selfie frame' so portraits taken at family fun days and community events could be publicised via social media. Over 50 people (including staff from Police Scotland, Strathclyde Fire and Rescue, colleges, schools and third sector organisations – as well as members of the public) put themselves in the frame.
- 3.2 Each Ward distributed approximately 2,500 information leaflets and this combined with the intense community engagement activity has made citizens more aware of PB and its impending arrival. As a result of these efforts, 120 people have been recruited to join the four Citizens Panels in the pilot Wards.
- 3.3 Calton Ward 9 Citizens Panel, namely Calton W9, is focussed on child poverty. Work is underway with the Child Poverty Action Group to help the Panel of 25 people understand child poverty and identify local solutions to some of the issues families' affected by child poverty experience. The Calton PB will be designed to help improve outcomes and the process and criteria will be developed to reflect this.

- 3.4 Canal Ward 16, namely 3C's Canal Community Choices, is focussed on economic activity. This panel of 15 people aim to identify and find solutions to their own economic issues, to make real decisions about spend and to become true equal partners' in the future economic development of their area.
- 3.5 Greater Pollok Ward 3 is focussed on young people. South West Arts & Media Project (SWAMP) have been working with young people, using a variety of media platforms including creating web-based TV programmes with young people to disseminate information about PB. They are currently supporting a group of 25 young people who are interested in being part of the Citizen's Panel and are scheduling workshops with Young Scot for online voting and All In for the PB training. They are developing PBTv for communicating the PB process, applications and decisions.
- 3.6 Pollokshields Ward 6 is focussed on black & minority ethnic (BME) communities. Work in Pollokshields has focused on distributing leaflets and working with local agencies to hold a series of public meetings targeted at reaching the BME population in the Ward, 90% of whom live in the Pollokshields locality. A Citizens Panel of 54 people has been established, 27 of whom are of BME origin, 17 are representative of BME organisations and 17 are white. Recent discussions have sought clarity that membership of the Citizens Panel will be mainly focussed on BME but not solely exclusive. CRER will be invited to work with the Citizens Panels to help members understand evidenced backed arguments over the need for BME focused groups.
- 3.7 The Glasgow Disability Alliance were award 10% of the 2018/19 PB budget to ensure disabled people are involved in PB pilot areas as well as in mainstream service provision. This demonstrates the local government's commitment to both PB and the inclusion of disabled people in the process of transformational community led budgeting.

4.0 Next steps

- 4.1 The PB Working Group completed their task to co-produce a draft PB framework for further consultation with communities, third sector organisations, equalities groups, officers and elected members
- 4.2 The PB Working Group had 40 members participating in the co-production of Glasgow's PB framework (see appendix 2). It is suggested the members of the Working Group become a Community of Practice (CoP) to oversee the future co-production of the framework as PB

evolves. A CoP is an informal, self-organized, network of peers with diverse skills and experience in an area of practice or profession.

- 4.3 In addition to the CoP, officers will take a partnership approach to deliver the operational aspects of the draft PB framework. It is suggested a PB partnership is formed to take this forward. The PB partnership will develop proposals to facilitate the implementation of Glasgow's PB framework and report back in due course.

5.0 Sharing Glasgow's PB Journey

- 5.1 As part of PB Scotland's Festival 2018, Dr Rosie Ilett was commissioned to write an article documenting Glasgow's PB journey. The article can be found at PB Scotland's website.

<https://pbscotland.scot/blog/2018/10/10/glasgows-pb-journey-detailed-in-new-report>

6.0 Policy and Resource Implications

Resource Implications:

Financial: As part of the budget setting process for 2018/19, £1million was made available for PB. This was agreed as £500,000 capital funding and £500,000 revenue funding.

2019/20 PB budgets for the continuation of the pilot sites and other Wards are still to be agreed. It is expected the PB framework and learning from the pilots will impact on the budget setting process and decision making.

Legal: None

Personnel:

Procurement: None

Council Strategic Plan: A Thriving Economy - the city and its citizens benefit from inclusive economic growth and are involved in economic decision making through participatory budgeting.

Resilient and Empowered Neighbourhoods- citizens and neighbourhoods can influence how services are developed and budgets spent. Priority 75; Extend participatory budgeting,

giving local people a say in how local budgets are spent and services delivered and examine options to establish a new community and equalities unit to support communities in this process

Equality Impacts:

Does the proposal support the Council's Equality Outcomes 2017-22

Yes

People with protected characteristics are more regularly and systematically involved in service delivery design by the Council Family.

What are the potential equality impacts as a result of this report?

Positive impacts on BME communities, young people, people who are economically inactive or affected by in-work poverty and families who experience child poverty. The PB process will be used to identify solutions to some of the issues the communities experience, determine their own outcomes and make decisions on how these budgets are allocated in their community.

Sustainability Impacts:

Environmental:

None

Social:

None

Economic:

None

Privacy and Data Protection impacts:

None

7.0 Recommendations

7.1 The committee is asked to:

- note the content of the report;
- consider the proposal that a PB Community of Practice oversee the future co-production of the PB Framework, as detailed in the report; and
- recommend approval of the Participatory Budgeting Framework to the City Administration Committee.

A Framework for Participatory Budgeting in Glasgow

This paper sets out the results of discussion sessions held between June and October 2018 where a co-productive approach was taken to develop a framework for Participatory Budgeting in Glasgow.

This framework is to be considered by the Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and Citizens Engagement City Policy Committee at its November 2018 meeting.

The draft framework is at point 5. Partners who attended sessions are listed in an appendix.

1. Introduction

The COSLA endorsed Report of the Commission on Strengthening Local Democracy (2014) stated that participatory budgeting was becoming ‘the standard by which [participation in decision making] is delivered in Scotland’.

Included in the 2016/17 Programme for Government was a commitment from Scottish Government to work in partnership with local government to have at least 1% of local authority budgets subject to Community Choices budgeting. Community Choices budgeting, better known worldwide as ‘participatory budgeting’ or PB, is recognised internationally as a way for local people to have a direct say in how public funds can be used to address local needs.

PB is recognised as an approach to ‘... help improve the democratic process by widening participation and re-invigorating the role of local authorities, local councillors and civil society. It can contribute to the effectiveness of public spending by improving the way money is invested by increasing the knowledge available to the local authority when undertaking service planning. It also has the potential to strengthen the community and voluntary sectors by increasing the number of people taking part in local democratic processes.’¹ Glasgow has embraced PB as an approach to meeting its commitment to values of openness, transparency and partnership working with citizens.

In 2018 Glasgow City Council’s Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and Citizens Engagement City Policy Committee asked a group of partners with a deep commitment to some of Glasgow’s communities to oversee the co-production of Glasgow’s Participatory Budgeting Framework.

¹ CoSLA October 2017 Leaders Item 5

2. Building on progress in Glasgow so far

Glasgow City Council have committed to participatory budgeting to help achieve the priorities found within strategic plans which cover:

- A Thriving Economy
- Resilient and Empowered Neighbourhoods

The outcomes Glasgow City Council looks for the following outcomes through participatory budgeting:

1. The city and its citizens benefit from inclusive economic growth and are involved in economic decision making through participatory budgeting;
2. Extend participatory budgeting, giving local people a say in how local budgets are spent and services delivered and examine options to establish a new community and equalities unit to support communities in this process.

Since 2014 Glasgow City Council has supported participatory budgeting in different forms, including:

- Small grants participatory budgeting programme
- Devolving funds participatory budgeting
- Mainstreaming participatory budgeting into council services

Achievements to date have included:

- Provision of training, awareness raising and capacity building support within communities and partner organisations.
- Participation in international learning exchanges in Portugal & Paris, reflected upon [here](#).
- Development of an [evaluation framework](#) in collaboration with a range of Community Planning Partners and What Works Scotland to measure how effective Glasgow's PB processes are.
- In 2016/17 delivery of a small grants funding programme allocating £321,000 of funding through 29 events and involving over 1,700 residents, evaluated [here](#).

2017/18 provided support to develop and facilitate a range of PB activities, including:

- Community Budgeting in Govan reported [here](#).
- South Glasgow Youth Bank Big Grant Giveaway [blog](#) and [video](#)
- Glasgow 2018 European Championships detailed [here](#)
- Capacity building support detailed [here](#).
- Created a PB film "Moving toward Mainstreaming PB [A Step Further Glasgow](#)"

3. How we define Participatory Budgeting

“PB directly involves local people in making decisions on the spending priorities for a defined public budget. This means engaging residents, communities and representatives of all parts of the community discussing spending priorities, make spending proposals and vote on them.”²

Participatory budgeting is a process of democratic deliberation and decision making, and a type of participatory democracy, in which citizens decide through a vote on how to allocate part of a public budget. It is recognised as a way for local people to have direct say in how, and where, public funds can be used to address inequality.

Put simply, PB empowers local people to play a key role in deciding how public money is spent in their community of place or interest. This ranges from funding community and voluntary groups to deliver projects of local value, to residents shaping what and how mainstream services are delivered in their areas.

At the heart of PB is the desire to deliver meaningful empowerment to communities and residents. This occurs in processes that:

- Directly involves local people in making decisions on the spending and priorities for a defined public budget
- Delivers interventions which are informed and influenced by communities where outcomes need to be improved
- Is community driven, based on community priorities and built on real evidence of need and inequality.

For PB to be effective it needs to be a repeated process rather than a one-off pilot. Through each cycle the process is refined and improved to best serve the particular community.

4. Glasgow’s commitment to 2020/21

Glasgow is committed to meeting the target of 1% of local authority budget being subject to participatory budgeting by the end of 2021. This is defined as ‘total estimated expenditure for revenue, as per the local government finance circular, less assumed council tax intake’.³

² (Participatory Budgeting in the UK – A toolkit; the PB Unit)

³ Community Choices Budgeting Framework CoSLA

5. The draft framework

This framework is made up of a vision for participatory budgeting in Glasgow and the beliefs and values that will guide PB in the city to achieve that vision.

Our Vision for Participatory Budgeting in Glasgow

Citizens will shape how the City of Glasgow* spends public money.

By supporting the participation of people from across our diverse communities we want participatory budgeting to help tackle inequality and build a fairer, more equal city.

(*We have debated whether this framework can apply to Glasgow City Council or to public services in Glasgow beyond those provided by the city council.)

The beliefs and values supporting participatory budgeting in Glasgow

Inclusion

People in Glasgow have many identities and are part of different communities, including communities of identity and interest. We cannot be participative if we exclude people because of, for example, poverty, disability or race.

We will know PB in Glasgow is inclusive when:

- All voices are recognised as being equally important.
- Resources are routinely budgeted to remove barriers to participation, ensure access and comply with the Scottish Public Sector Equality Duties.
- We bring PB to often marginalised communities.
- We use clear language, understood by the community.
- We can evidence and review our progress by routinely monitoring all stages or our processes and decision making.

Collaboration

Participatory budgeting should be organised in a way that builds on relationships and skills of citizens, community organisations, officials and elected representatives. If other values within this framework are achieved, collaboration is the result.

We will know we have collaborative participatory budgeting in Glasgow when:

- Partners are resourced to support PB in Glasgow with their skills, assets and networks.
- We look for a culture change in the way partners work together.

Deliberation

Deliberation describes a process where people are supported to make decisions on what is best for the community as a whole, rather than for them individually. Good deliberation leads to empowered communities better able to make 'good' decisions.

We know we have deliberative participatory budgeting in Glasgow when:

- PB in Glasgow takes the time and thoughtful, inclusive facilitation to be based on dialogue between citizens, communities, partner organisations and city government.
- Budget decisions made about how money is spent, are reached through public discussions and informed by diverse views.
- The difference PB makes to communities is understood and shared.
- We would expect to see 'different' spending decisions between before and after PB and between communities.
- We recognise the value of lived experience

Empowerment

Participatory Budgeting involves citizens taking their power in decisions that affect them. We want PB in Glasgow to build on citizen's skills, confidence and abilities to participate in decisions about how public money is spent.

We know we have empowering participatory budgeting in Glasgow when:

- Glasgow's diverse communities, feel more in control and it can be evidenced that they have more control over public spending and public services.
- We see evidence of meaningful participation from more marginalised groups i.e. disabled people.
- Communities and community organisations take a lead in facilitating 'their' PB process.
- We implement what people collectively decide.
- Council officers are empowered and supported to deliver PB and trusted to work with communities.

Transparency and accountability

Decision making should take place in the open at all stages of participatory budgeting in Glasgow. We will be accountable to citizens and to our legal requirements.

We will know that we have achieved this in Glasgow when:

- Partners from elected, public, community and voluntary sectors have strategic oversight of Glasgow's PB processes.
- The purpose of the PB processes is clear and there is greater understanding of what the ideas around PB.
- Information on budgets is widely available in a way that is meaningful to citizens.
- We are clear on the boundaries of PB in Glasgow, the possibilities and the limits.
- We increase understanding on how public money is spent and choices between priorities are made.

Sustainability

Good participatory budgeting is based on trust and evaluates, learns and adapts year on year. Citizens will only get involved when they see that they make a difference. This takes time and sustainability.

We know we have sustainable PB in Glasgow when:

- Cross party commitment to PB is in place.
- PB processes in Glasgow are continuous across budget cycles.
- PB is sustained by communities. It is planned and resourced to add to the skills and capacities in communities year on year, and does not take away from them. These skills sustain PB.
- PB becomes the normal way of doing things, this is mainstreaming.
- We revisit this framework as PB develops and review why and how we are doing PB.

Involvement

Participatory budgeting is based on the involvement of citizens, this goes beyond voting at the end of a process.

We will know we have achieved this in Glasgow when:

- Communities are involved in planning, implementing and evaluating the PB process.
- Involvement includes all stages of the budget cycle and all stages of the PB process.
- We can evidence involvement of people who have not previously been engaged.

Appendix 2 - partners involved.

Good participatory budgeting is done with and not to communities. This framework has created by using a co-productive approach with partners with deep knowledge and insight into our communities and participatory budgeting. They include

Child Poverty Action Group

COSLA

Faith in Community Scotland

Glasgow Centre for Population Health

Glasgow Caledonian University

Glasgow City Council elected members and departments

Glasgow Disability Alliance

Glasgow Homelessness Network

Glasgow Third Sector Interface

Glasgow Young Movers

IRISS

North West Glasgow Voluntary Sector Network

Pollokshields Development Agency

Pollokshields Development Trust

Possibilities

Scottish Community Development Centre

Scottish Government

Scottish Refugee Council

Spirit of Possilpark

SWAMP

Urban Fox

West of Scotland Regional Equality Council

What Works Scotland

Scottish Community Development Centre