



**Glasgow City Council**  
**City Administration Committee**

**Item 1**  
28th November 2019

**Report by Councillor Chris Cunningham, City Convener for Education, Skills and Early Years**

**Contact: Jim Wilson Ext 74086**

**ENTRANCE CRITERIA FOR NOTRE DAME HIGH SCHOOL**

**Purpose of Report:**  
To note the contents of the report and seek approval to progress with the recommended option on the entry criteria and catchment area for Notre Dame High School.

**Recommendations:**  
The Committee is asked:

- to note the contents of this report; and
- that the 'third option' consulted on is approved, that is change the entry criteria for Notre Dame high School to be co-educational and change the catchment areas for Notre Dame High School to include Notre Dame Primary School, St Patrick's Primary School and St Joseph's Primary School. In this option, the catchment areas for St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School, St Roch's Secondary School and John Paul Secondary School would also change.

Ward No(s): 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, Citywide:  
22 and 23

Local member(s) advised: Yes  No  consulted: Yes  No

**THIS IS A FORMAL  
CONSULTATION  
DOCUMENT**

**Consultation Response :**

This is the statutory **Consultation Response Document** in relation to the consultation on entrance criteria for Notre Dame High School, and as a consequence, the potential alteration of catchment areas. The schools and establishments affected by the consultation and/or proposals are detailed below and on page 2.

The consultation process and response are in line with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 as amended.

<b>School(s)</b>	<b>Ward(s)</b>	<b>Strategic Planning Area</b>	<b>Learning Communities</b>
<p>The Primary and secondary schools within the Notre Dame, John Paul, St Roch's and St Thomas Aquinas Learning Communities</p> <p><i>The schools in the above Learning Communities are listed on the next page</i></p>	<p>10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 22 and 23</p>	<p>North West</p>	<p>Notre Dame, John Paul, St Roch's and St Thomas Aquinas Learning Communities</p>

**REPORT BY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION**

*This document has been issued by Glasgow City Council for consultation in terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 as amended.*

The Ordnance Survey map data included within this document is provided by Glasgow City Council under license from Ordnance Survey in order to fulfil its public function in relation to this public consultation. Persons viewing this mapping should contact Ordnance Survey Copyright for advice where they wish to license Ordnance Survey mapping/data for their own use.

## **Schools/Establishments in Learning Communities**

### **John Paul Academy Learning Community**

John Paul Academy  
Langa Street Nursery  
Maryhill Park Nursery  
St Blane's Primary  
St Charles' Language and Communication Resource  
St Charles' Primary  
St Joseph's Primary  
St Mary's Primary

### **St Roch's Secondary Learning Community**

St Roch's Secondary  
Benview Early Years Centre  
Hamiltonhill Family Learning Centre  
Keppoch Nursery  
Royston Nursery  
Sighthill Nursery  
St Cuthbert's Primary  
St Kevin's Primary  
St Mungo's Primary and Nursery Class  
St Roch's Hearing Impairment Unit (Secondary)  
St Roch's Primary and Hearing Impairment Unit  
St Stephen's Primary  
St Teresa's Primary

### **St Thomas Aquinas Secondary/Notre Dame High - Joint Learning Community**

Notre Dame High  
St Thomas Aquinas Secondary  
Corpus Christi Primary  
Cranstonhill Nursery  
Elle Street Nursery  
Knightswood Early Years Service  
Notre Dame Primary  
Sandy Road Day Nursery  
Sandyford Day Nursery  
St Brendan's Primary  
St Clare's Primary  
St Ninian's Primary  
St Patrick's Primary  
St Paul's (Whiteinch) Primary

## **1 BACKGROUND**

- 1.1 Notre Dame High School is a denominational, comprehensive secondary school for girls located in the West End of Glasgow. The school celebrated its Centenary in 1997.
- 1.2 Notre Dame High is a successful and popular school. It has two associated primary schools from which girls are entitled to transfer to the High School; Notre Dame Primary School and St Ninian's Primary School. Some girls attending Corpus Christi Primary School are also entitled to transfer due to a shared catchment area.
- 1.3 The school has a capacity of 800, with a roll of 728 (as at 2019 census). The school roll includes 580 placing requests from over 50 primary schools across the city.
- 1.4 Entry criteria for schools are determined by local authorities. Local authorities throughout Scotland adopt a range of differing entry criteria. For schools in Glasgow the key entrance criteria for any mainstream secondary school is based upon a defined geographical catchment area (a 'delineated' area). Every address within Glasgow has a catchment area (or shared catchment area) for both a denominational school, a non-denominational school and a Gaelic Medium school.
- 1.5 Notre Dame High School shares its delineated catchment area with part of the St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School delineated catchment area. This is due to Notre Dame's status as a single-gender (girls) school and the consequent necessary sharing of school catchment areas with the secondary school that the boys attend. Girls who reside within this shared area and who are educated within the denominational sector, are entitled to transfer to either St Thomas Aquinas or Notre Dame High School.
- 1.6 In line with the City Administration's commitment to undertake a public consultation under the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 to consider the entry criteria for Notre Dame High School, officers initially engaged with Parent Councils and campaign groups between October and December 2018.
- 1.7 Thereafter, a statutory consultation period, approved by the City Administration Committee, commenced on 18 March 2019 and closed on 26 May 2019.

## **2. PROPOSED OPTIONS**

- 2.1 Three options were considered during the consultation period; these were:
  1. Leave the Notre Dame High entry criteria as is; that is, no change.
  2. Retain the all-girl status, but change the associated primary schools and thereby alter the local catchment area.

3. Change to be a co-educational denominational secondary school and alter the local catchment area.
- 2.2 Options 2 and 3 impact upon other denominational secondary school catchment areas in the North West of the city. There are three denominational Learning Communities that would/could be directly affected by changes to the entry criteria at Notre Dame High School. These are the John Paul, St Roch's and St Thomas Aquinas/Notre Dame Learning Communities.

### **3 THE CONSULTATION PROCESS**

- 3.1 The Council held three public meetings; in Notre Dame High School, St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School and St Roch's Secondary School.
- 3.2 The Council advised that requests for alternative forms of consultation papers or response documents would be accommodated wherever possible e.g. audio or by interpreted support. There were interpreters for the 15 languages requested, and/or most used, at each of the public meetings.
- 3.3 The Council consulted with parents, children, young people and the wider community in relation to the proposals. Notices to advise of the consultation arrangements were placed in the press and a dedicated page was set up on the Council website; for information and to enable interested parties to respond to the consultation.
- 3.4 The majority of consultation responses were via a *Smart Survey* questionnaire on the web-site. All responses received on paper before the end of the consultation period were scanned by Council officers and added to the database to facilitate analysis and reporting.
- 3.5 The consultees included:
  - Parent Councils
  - Parents/carers
  - Children and Young People
  - Staff
  - Trade Unions
  - Community Councils
  - Area Partnerships
  - Groups formed under Part 2 of the Local Government in Scotland Act (2003)
  - Archdiocese of Glasgow
  - Adjacent local authorities
  - Other users of the school premises
- 3.6 Children and young people were included in the statutory consultation process, in addition, meetings were held with small groups in their schools after the statutory period concluded in order to seek their views on the consultation process.

3.7 The consultation is in line with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010, and as such, all responses to the consultation were shared with Education Scotland at the conclusion of the statutory consultation period. Education Services subsequently received a report back from Education Scotland. The Council took cognisance of this report.

#### 4. **CONSULTATION RESPONSES**

4.1 There were 7,110 responses to the consultation. Of these, 4,747 were 'complete' and 2,363 were 'partial' responses. Senior officers read all the responses and checked for duplications and incomplete responses. A significant number of the partial responses did not indicate a choice of option and so were discounted.

4.2 From the 2,363 partial responses received, of these only 191 respondents went as far as selecting one of the available options.

4.2.1 These 191 responses were extracted from the partial response dataset and this extracted dataset was then further analysed to determine how many respondents had then gone on to submit a full response in the complete responses dataset. Any of the partial responses that were deemed to align with a complete response were then removed from the initial 191 partial responses. This was to avoid double counting of responses.

4.2.3 The complete responses dataset (i.e. the 4,747 responses) was also analysed to determine where respondents had submitted multiple responses. Following analysis of respondents IP addresses, names submitted, and email address provided, any identifiable multiple responses were removed from the final count of responses. Combining the validated responses after these processes gave a response total of 4,761.

4.2.4 All comments left as part of the consultation were considered during the validation process whether the response was counted in the final total or not.

4.2.5 The table below details the overall validated responses for the consultation.

Answer Choice - All Respondents	Response Percent	Response Total
Option 1 - Leave the Notre Dame High entry criteria as it is, that is, no change	39.9%	1898
Option 2 - Retain the all girls' status, but change the associated primary school configuration; and thereby alter the catchment area.	13.4%	638
Option 3 - Change to be a co-educational denominational secondary school and alter the catchment area.	45.9%	2184
None of the Above/Alternative Proposal	0.9%	41
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>4761</b>

4.3 The table below shows the various categories of respondents in favour of Option 1.

Answer choice by respondent type: Option 1	Response Percent	Response Total
Parent - GCC Primary School Pupil	18.0%	341
Parent - GCC Secondary School Pupil	11.0%	208
Pupil - GCC Primary School Pupil	2.8%	54
Pupil - GCC Secondary School Pupil	7.3%	138
Staff - GCC Primary School	2.2%	41
Staff - GCC Secondary School	1.2%	22
Staff - GCC (not school staff)	0.5%	10
Resident	23.1%	438
GCC Councillor	0.4%	8
Other (please specify):	33.6%	638
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>1898</b>

4.3.1 The following statements are examples of the comments made by respondents in favour of Option 1.

- *“Leave the school as it is fantastic nurturing environment giving so many a chance!”*
- *“The school benefits and promotes young women both in education and the workplace. The achievements of former pupils is evidence of this”*

- *“Notre Dame is the only Single Sex School in Scotland and provides good opportunities for girls that they would not have in coeducational system”*
- *“School provides a great learning experience”*
- *“Notre Dame is giving a choice in same way as the school of dance or school of sport so don't understand why it's being challenged. It's helping raise attainment and encouraging girls in a very unequal world so it should be kept.”*

4.4 The table below shows the various categories of respondents in favour of Option 2.

Answer choice by respondent type: Option 2	Response Percent	Response Total
Parent - GCC Primary School Pupil	18.5%	118
Parent - GCC Secondary School Pupil	17.9%	114
Pupil - GCC Primary School Pupil	2.5%	16
Pupil - GCC Secondary School Pupil	6.6%	42
Staff - GCC Primary School	1.3%	8
Staff - GCC Secondary School	1.7%	11
Staff - GCC (not school staff)	1.6%	10
Resident	17.9%	114
GCC Councillor	0.2%	1
Other (please specify):	32.0%	204
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>638</b>

4.4.1 The following statements are examples of the comments made by respondents in favour of Option 2

- *“Widen the schools catchment to encourage more girls to attend city wide”*
- *“Option 2 is a suitable option as it allows more girls to come to this well-reputed school and that it stays as part of single-sex education, something that is very unique and the only all girls' school in Glasgow”*
- *“Would like to see the catchment area extended and to keep St Ninian's Primary as a feeder school to Notre Dame Secondary”*
- *“The importance of keeping single sex education that is kicking above its weight. Please keep areas of social deprivation included in Notre Dame. Include St Ninians in the catchment area”*



- *“It makes sense to move the catchments into line with the rest of the city, but I would like to see the choice of an all-girls education retained. It makes such a difference to uptake of STEM in particular”.*

4.5 The table below shows the various categories of respondents in favour of Option 3.

Answer choice by respondent type: Option 3	Response Percent	Response Total
Parent - GCC Primary School Pupil	27.3%	596
Parent - GCC Secondary School Pupil	4.2%	92
Pupil - GCC Primary School Pupil	5.0%	110
Pupil - GCC Secondary School Pupil	1.7%	38
Staff - GCC Primary School	1.8%	39
Staff - GCC Secondary School	1.8%	39
Staff - GCC (not school staff)	0.5%	12
Resident	37.1%	811
GCC Councillor	0.0%	1
Other (please specify):	20.4%	446
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>2184</b>

4.5.1 The following statements are examples of the comments made by respondents in favour of Option 3.

- *“I think it is a huge oversight not including St Charles boys in the Catchment. Please re-consider the catchment to include St Charles.”*
- *“The current practice is sex discrimination. It only offers choice for girls, and this choice impacts boys and their families in the local community”*
- *“Education is a right for all, it's time to end gender segregation in our public schools.”*
- *“I think option 3 would best serve the local community, enables equal education for all local boys and girls and means that children at primary schools in the local area can transition to secondary school together”*
- *“A publically funded school should be open to all”*

4.6 The following table shows the various categories of respondents who proposed 'none of the above/alternative proposal'.

Answer choice by respondent type: None of the Above/Alternative Proposal	Response Percent	Response Total
Parent - GCC Primary School Pupil	19.5%	8
Parent - GCC Secondary School Pupil	9.8%	4
Pupil - GCC Primary School Pupil	0.0%	0
Pupil - GCC Secondary School Pupil	2.4%	1
Staff - GCC Primary School	0.0%	0
Staff - GCC Secondary School	0.0%	0
Staff - GCC (not school staff)	0.0%	0
Resident	46.3%	19
GCC Councillor	0.0%	0
Other (please specify):	22.0%	9
<b>Total</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>41</b>

4.6.1 The following statements are examples of the comments made by respondents proposing alternative proposals.

- *“Change Notre Dame to a non-denominational co-educational secondary school.”*
- *“The school should be co-educational and non-denominational school for all children in the local area”*
- *“St Charles’ boys should be allowed to go”*

4.7 It is clear from an analysis of the responses that there was neither a consensus nor a clear preference from the respondents overall as to how the Council should proceed.

## **5 EDUCATION SCOTLAND (HMI) REPORT ON EDUCATIONAL ASPECTS**

5.1 The key educational aspects that HMI raised in their report are looked at in this section. Officers took cognisance of the Education Scotland report prior to compiling the consultation response Document. The Education Scotland extracts are in italics with Education Services’ comment/response thereafter.

### **5.2 Education Scotland**

*Staff at Notre Dame High School outlined the challenge of ensuring effective transitions when children are coming from over 50 different primary schools. Continuity in pupils’ learning at the point of transition between Notre Dame Primary School and Notre Dame High School would be more manageable if boys as well as girls were attending Notre Dame High School. The current position sees a fragmentation and dispersal of movement from Notre Dame Primary school to a wide variety of secondary schools. The variation in arrangements for induction days to secondary schools leads to interruption for learners.*

#### 5.2.1 **Education Services**

Officers in Education Services agree that having all Glasgow City Council schools co-educational would lead to a more consistent approach for children when transitioning to secondary school. This would enhance transition planning and progression from primary to secondary. Having a defined local catchment area would allow for enhanced transition visits for all young people as fewer primaries would be involved.

#### 5.3 **Education Scotland**

*HM Inspectors have not been provided with convincing evidence to support the claim that girls are attaining better or indeed worse in a single sex environment. There is potential for improvements in terms of planning for transition, parental engagement and reducing travel across the city, should option three be accepted.*

#### 5.3.1 **Education Services**

Education Services agrees with these points and has never sought to argue that co-educational, as opposed to girls only, was about improving attainment nor vice-versa. The consultation was about 'how' we should deliver high quality education in Notre Dame High School. Officers are also of the view that Option 3 provides potential for improvement. This is further explored in the Educational Benefit section of this report.

#### 5.4 **Education Scotland**

*In finalising its report, it is important that the Council's educational benefits statement demonstrates clearly how the Council has identified and intends to balance the diverse interests and views expressed. The Council should continue to work closely with all stakeholders and give consideration to all evidence when considering which option to take forward.*

#### 5.4.1 **Education Services**

Education Services Officers proactively engaged with interested parties prior to, during, and post the consultation period. There will clearly be those who perceive their situation to be affected positively by the final outcome, those who perceive the changes as negatively affecting their situation, and those for whom no perceived change is anticipated. However, the Council shall continue to work with all stakeholders around transitions and excellence and equity in Glasgow City Council schools.

#### 5.5 **Education Scotland (SUMMARY)**

*Stakeholder groups and individuals hold strong and varied views about the relative merits of the different options. Children, young people and parents have deep-seated views which are mainly polarised into supporting the status quo or supporting a change which will see Notre Dame High School enrol both boys and girls in the future. A much smaller percentage favoured increasing the catchment area to include higher numbers of local girls (option two).*

*HM Inspectors have not been provided with convincing evidence to support the claim that girls are attaining better or indeed worse in a single sex environment. There is potential for improvements in terms of planning for*

*transition, parental engagement and reducing travel across the city, should option three be accepted. Currently, the educational benefits outlined by the Council do not present a compelling case for any of the three options. In finalising its report, it is important that the Council's education benefits statement demonstrates clearly how the Council has identified and intends to balance the diverse interests and views expressed. The Council should continue to work closely with all stakeholders and give consideration to all evidence available when considering which option to take forward.*

#### **5.5.1 Education Services (SUMMARY)**

We note that the Education Scotland report contains similar views to those of Education Services Officers. That is, there was strong and varied views expressed during the consultation, that there are significant opportunities to improve transitions, and that there is no compelling evidence around attainment in co-educational schools, as opposed to single gender schools, or vice versa. We agree that we should clearly demonstrate how we shall support the broad and varied interests moving forward and the detail in relation to benefits/transition contained in this response addresses this.

### **6 RECOMMENDED OPTION**

- 6.1 It is recommended that the 'third option' consulted upon is approved (with a minor amendment detailed in 6.1.1). That is, change the entry criteria for Notre Dame High School to be co-educational and change the catchment areas for Notre Dame High School to include Notre Dame Primary School, St Patrick's Primary School and St Joseph's Primary School. In this option, the catchment areas for St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School, St Roch's Secondary School and John Paul Academy would also change.
- 6.1.1 The catchment area that was consulted on for option 3 incorporates the inclusion of an additional small area into the shared St Joseph's and St Charles' catchment area and detailed in section 6.6.
- 6.2 This option would offer co-educational education with the associated primary schools as shown in the following table. St Ninian's Primary School would no longer be associated with Notre Dame High School in order to support the formation of a 'local catchment area'. There had been responses seeking St Ninian's primary to be included. However, officers do not feel that its inclusion is in line with the policy of local schools due to the nature of the resultant catchment area. However, in recognition of the current position where girls from St Ninian's Primary School do have a right to transfer. This right would continue until the current P1 leave the primary school, that is, until August 2025.

<b><u>John Paul Academy</u></b>	<b><u>Notre Dame High</u></b>	<b><u>St Roch's Sec</u></b>	<b><u>St Thomas Aquinas Sec</u></b>
St Charles'	<b>Notre Dame Primary</b> <i>(Now allocated to Notre Dame High Only)</i>	St Cuthbert's	Corpus Christi
St Blane's	<b>St Patrick's</b>	St Mungo's	St Brendan's
St Mary's	<b>St Joseph's</b>	St Roch's Prim	St Ninian's <i>(Now allocated to St Thomas Aq. only)</i>
		St Stephen's	St Paul's (Whiteinch)
		St Teresa's	
<b>St Joseph's (shared area)</b> <i>moved to Notre Dame</i>		<b>St Joseph's (shared area)</b> <i>moved to Notre Dame</i>	<b>St Patrick's moved to Notre Dame</b>

- 6.3 Alterations would be required to ensure that appropriate toilet and changing facilities were available within Notre Dame High School. The cost estimate is £750,000. Should this proposal be approved then further detailed work would be carried out and this cost estimate may change.
- 6.4 Should this option be approved then officers would ensure that boys would start to enrol from S1 only (from August 2021) which would enable a five year period of transition before the school became fully co-educational. This proposal does not include the option of boys transitioning from other schools into other year groups, either by right due to being in the delineated catchment or by placing request.
- 6.5 Not all families would want their children to transfer to Notre Dame High School. Families with siblings already in secondary school would retain the right to transfer to that secondary school (where they resided within the previous delineated catchment area). For example, a pupil attending St Patrick's Primary School who has an older sibling at St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School, and his parents wish him/her to attend the same school, would be entitled to a place in St Thomas Aquinas as if he/she lived in the catchment area.
- 6.6 It is also proposed that there is a minor change to the catchment area of St Charles' Primary School. The change is that the area, as shown in Appendix 3, becomes a shared catchment area of St Joseph's and St Charles' Primary Schools. Appendix 2 shows a small area which is surrounded by the shared area for St Charles' Primary and St Joseph's Primary. It is therefore proposed to include this in the shared area for both schools.
- 6.7 The rationale for recommending co-educational education was on the basis that the consultation was in relation to 'how' to deliver education at Notre Dame High. As previously highlighted by Education Services and Education Scotland, the academic arguments for preferring co-educational education as opposed to single gender, or vice-versa, is not compelling.

Glasgow City Council strives to ensure excellence and equity in its schools irrespective of the nature of them.

## **7 ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS**

- 7.1 There were 41 responses to the option 'none of the above/alternative proposal', that is, less than 1% of respondents. See sections 4.6 and 4.6.1. Of the 41 responses, only a small number proposed an alternative. These are summarised below.
- 7.2 It was proposed that St Charles' Primary School 'replaced' St Joseph's Primary School in Option 3. Officers discounted this as children living in the St Joseph's area would then be walking/travelling through the Notre Dame High School catchment area to attend John Paul Academy. However, a minor change was approved as detailed in section 6.6.
- 7.3 It was proposed that St Charles' Primary School was included alongside St Joseph's Primary School in Option 3. Officers discounted this as this would eventually place pressure on the capacity of Notre Dame High.
- 7.4 It was proposed that Education Services didn't need to retain Notre Dame High School. Officers discounted this as there is insufficient capacity in the other denominational secondary schools in the North West of the city.
- 7.5 It was proposed that the Council should have a boys' school if the girls' school was to be retained. The Council does not intend to progress this option.
- 7.6 It was proposed that the school should be non-denominational. The Council does not intend to progress this option.

## **8 EDUCATIONAL BENEFIT STATEMENT FOR THE PROPOSED OPTION**

- 8.1 The key benefits for recommending option 3 are contained in this section.

### **8.2 The Children**

Having all Glasgow City Council schools co-educational would lead to a consistent level of equity and parity for children when transitioning to secondary school. It would mean that boys would be able to transition to the same secondary school as their sisters, where appropriate. This would also enhance transition planning and progression from primary to secondary. This was a matter that was also highlighted in the Education Scotland report.

Children would benefit from a better transition. Notre Dame High School, similar to other secondary schools across the city, would be able to work with their associated primary schools and develop a transition programme which introduced children to secondary stage learning from an earlier age. For example, from P5 there could be closer links developed for the science curriculum. This would have a positive impact on children's learning.

Children with additional support needs would be identified at an earlier stage and planning put in place to ensure that the teachers in Notre Dame High School were better informed. More children with additional support needs would also be able to benefit from an enhanced transition programme.

There would be an increase in the number of young people able to walk to school due to a more aligned, local catchment area. This would reduce the traffic congestion around the school at the end and start of the school day and have health benefits for the young people.

### **8.3 Parents, Carers and Local Community**

Should the school become co-educational then parents and carers of children would benefit from having a consistent approach to co-educational education. This would support the Council's position of 'local schools for local children' in order to deliver community cohesion; as the key-entry criteria would be based on where you live.

It would enhance parental engagement if parents were more geographically aligned with the school as attendance at parents' evenings, workshops, events, parent Council and other ad hoc meetings/events would be easier.

### **8.4 Other users**

There would be no change.

### **8.5 Future users of the provision**

Parents, carers and children progressing through primary school, would have a clearer understanding of the secondary school/s that they would have an entitlement to attend as this/these would be based on their permanent residential address at the time of enrolment into secondary. However, in recognition of the current position where girls from St Ninian's Primary School currently have a right to transfer. This right would continue until the current P1 at St Ninian's leave, that is, until August 2025.

### **8.6 Other schools/establishments in our authority**

Other schools and establishments would be affected; this was highlighted in the consultation paper and explored during the consultation period. Officers would liaise with the Learning Communities and schools listed in section 6.4.3 to ensure that the appropriate advice, guidance and supports are put in place.

### **8.7 The anticipated effects on other schools are:**

- The roll at John Paul Academy may reduce over time as the St Joseph's Primary School catchment area would now be aligned with Notre Dame High School; this would accordingly alter the delineated catchment area of John Paul Academy.
- The roll at St Thomas Aquinas' may alter as the St Patrick's Primary School catchment area would now be aligned with Notre Dame High School; this would accordingly alter the delineated catchment area of

St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School. The roll projections for St Thomas Aquinas includes girls who could previously attend Notre Dame High School by right.

**8.8 Our assessment of any other likely effects of the proposal (if implemented)**

As is the case in any consultation of this scale, there may be those who perceive their situation to be affected positively, those who perceive the changes as negatively affecting their situation, and those for whom no perceived change is anticipated. Officers are not aware of any material affects that haven't been addressed elsewhere in this document.

**8.9 How we would intend to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal (if implemented)**

Education Services has a duty to secure improvement in education. Through our quality assurance and improvement policy, Education Services monitors and supports the quality of education being delivered in all its establishments. This policy would be used to monitor and support the quality of education being delivered in the various schools affected in order to ensure that provision for young people continues to develop and improve in line with the Council's priorities. Education Services would monitor the arrangements for transition to ensure continuity of learning was not compromised.

**8.10 The benefits, which we believe, would result from implementation of this proposal**

Moving to co-educational would support families who wish siblings (M/F) to attend the same secondary school within their community.

The move to co-educational would allow a better use of resources. In particular, there are existing capacity pressures on St Thomas Aquinas and John Paul Academy; having Notre Dame as a further co-educational denominational secondary in the North West of the city would contribute to the resolution of these pressures.

The Council has a duty to demonstrate best value in all aspects of its work. This option would provide better value for money as the Council could mitigate against future spend in relation to the physical expansion of schools in order to accommodate local children/young people.

Property and Land Services is currently installing modular accommodation at St Thomas Aquinas in order to support over-capacity. The cost to adapt Notre Dame to be suitable as a co-educational school (circa £750K) is significantly below the cost to build a permanent extension to another secondary school.

As already noted transitions, from over 50 primaries, is a significant challenge. Having a defined catchment area would provide enhanced transition support



for young people as fewer primaries, and people, would be involved in the transition process. Section 8.2 provides detail on the benefits to young people.

## **9 EQUALITY STATEMENT**

9.1 An Equality Impact assessment (Screening) was undertaken as part of the consultation exercise to assess if the proposal discriminates against anyone on the basis of:

- Age
- Gender
- Religion
- Racial Group
- Disability
- Sexual Orientation

9.2 In carrying out the equality impact assessment screening we also took account of any equality issues raised in written or oral representation made as part of the consultation process. The result of the assessment is included in Appendix 10 and is also available on the Glasgow City Council website.

## **10 Preparation of Consultation Report**

10.1 Education Services reviewed every response to the proposals. This report has taken due regard of written/email responses, the Education Scotland report, and the points and oral representations made at the public meetings. The key points made at the public meetings are in Appendix 9.

10.2 This consultation response report has been published in electronic and printed format. It is available on the Glasgow City Council website and at Education Services, City Chambers East Building, 40 John Street, Glasgow G1 1JL and at the affected schools free of charge. All those who received direct notification of the consultation will be sent a response summary which contains the link to the full consultation response document. All those who responded and provided contact details (name, address and email) through the consultation process will also be sent a summary and the link to the full consultation response document.

## **11 Note on Corrections**

11.1 If any inaccuracy or omission is discovered in this proposal document and/or during the consultation either by Education Services or any person, Education Services will determine if relevant information has been omitted or, if there has been an inaccuracy. Education Services will then take appropriate action, which may include the issue of a correction or the reissuing of the proposal document or the revision of the timescale for the consultation period as appropriate. In that event, relevant consultees and Education Scotland will be advised.

11.2 The Council is not aware of any inaccuracy or omission.

## 12 PROPOSED DATE FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION

12.1 Young people are registered for secondary school in November of the year preceding the August intake. Therefore, should option 3 be approved, it is proposed that the new arrangements come into effect for entry to secondary school for August 2021. The rationale is that there would be insufficient time to make the necessary changes to the enrollment procedures and to carry out the adaptations at Notre Dame High School.

12.2 Officers would keep parents, young people and staff fully apprised of progress throughout this period in order to ensure effective transitions.

## 13 Scottish Ministers' Call-In

13.1 The Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 does not require referral to Scottish Ministers in cases other than closure of schools.

## 14. POLICY AND RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

### Resource Implications:

*Financial:* Within existing resources

*Legal:* Consultation undertaken in accordance with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 (as amended)

*Personnel:* N/A

*Procurement:* N/A

**Council Strategic Plan:** Excellent and Inclusive Education - 35

### Equality and Socio-Economic Impacts:

*Does the proposal support the Council's Equality Outcomes 2017-22* Yes

*What are the potential equality impacts as a result of this report?* An equalities assessment undertaken during the consultation and included in the response document

*Please highlight if the policy/proposal will help address socio* The proposal is not linked to disadvantage.

*economic disadvantage.*

### **Sustainability Impacts:**

*Environmental:* The proposal would have very limited environmental impact.

*Social, including opportunities under Article 20 of the European Public Procurement Directive:* The proposal assist parents as there is greater clarity.

### **Privacy and Data Protection impacts:**

Responders asked to provide name, age, email address and reason(s) for responding. The data will only be used/held by Glasgow City Council for the purposes of consultation under the Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010.

## **15 Recommendations**

15.1 The Committee is asked:

- to note the contents of this report; and
- that the 'third option' consulted on is approved, that is change the entry criteria for Notre Dame high School to be co-educational and change the catchment areas for Notre Dame High School to include Notre Dame Primary School, St Patrick's Primary School and St Joseph's Primary School. In this option, the catchment areas for St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School, St Roch's Secondary School and John Paul Secondary School would also change.

### Education Scotland Report

#### 1. Introduction

1.1 This report from Education Scotland has been prepared by Her Majesty's Inspectors of Education (HM Inspectors) in accordance with the terms of the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 ("the 2010 Act"). The purpose of the report is to provide an independent and impartial consideration of Glasgow City Council's proposal to consult on the entry criteria for Notre Dame High School. Section 2 of the report sets out brief details of the consultation process. Section 3 of the report sets out HM Inspectors' consideration of the educational aspects of the proposal, including significant views expressed by consultees. Section 4 summarises HM Inspectors' overall view of the proposal. Upon receipt of this report, the Act requires the Council to consider it and then prepare its final consultation report. The Council's final consultation report should include this report and must contain an explanation of how, in finalising the proposal, it has reviewed the initial proposal, including a summary of points raised during the consultation process and the Council's response to them.

1.2 HM Inspectors considered:

- the likely effects of the proposal for children and young people of the schools; any other users; children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the Council area;
- any other likely effects of the proposal;
- how the Council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal; and
- the educational benefits the Council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the Council's reasons for coming to these beliefs.

1.3 In preparing this report, HM Inspectors undertook the following activities:

- attendance at the public meetings held on 16 April, 25 April and 7 May 2019 in connection with the Council's proposals;
- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the Council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others;
- consideration of further representations made directly to Education Scotland on relevant educational aspects of the proposal;
- consideration of further information on all schools affected; and

- visits to the sites of Notre Dame High School, St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School, Notre Dame Primary School and St Ninians' Primary School, including discussion with relevant consultees. These included representatives from Parent Councils from across Glasgow City Council.

## **2. Consultation process**

- 2.1 Glasgow City Council undertook the consultation on its proposal(s) with reference to the [Schools \(Consultation\) \(Scotland\) Act 2010](#).
- 2.2 The consultation process ran from 18 March until 26 May 2019. Three public meetings were held in Notre Dame High School, St Thomas Aquinas Secondary School and St Roch's Secondary School. Commendably, to support the inclusion of families with languages other than English, Glasgow City Council made arrangements for interpreters for 15 languages to be present at the public meetings. Each public meeting followed the same format. Two groups of parents and supporters, one representing the status quo and one arguing for change, put forward their views on the proposal through presentations. Council officers then responded to questions from the audience. There was a high level of public interest and response to the Council's online questionnaire (4,761 fully completed and over 2,000 partially completed). From the fully completed responses, the percentages in favour of the various options were 39.9% for option one, 13.4% for option two, 45.9% for option three and 0.9% for none of the three options.

## **3. Educational aspects of proposal**

- 3.1 The educational benefits statement contained within the proposal provides some helpful information. However, there is scope for the Council to outline more clearly how each of the options being considered supports its aspirations for the future of education within the city, including providing local schools for local children. HM Inspectors note that not all parts of Notre Dame High School are fully accessible to users with mobility issues. Staff at Notre Dame High School outlined the challenge of ensuring effective transitions when children are coming from over 50 different primary schools. Continuity in pupils' learning at the point of transition between Notre Dame Primary School and Notre Dame High School would be more manageable if boys as well as girls were attending Notre Dame High School. The current position sees a fragmentation and dispersal of movement from Notre Dame Primary School to a wide variety of secondary schools. The variation in arrangements for induction days to secondary schools leads to interruption for learners.
- 3.2 HM Inspectors met with a range of stakeholders including children and young people, parents (including Chairs of Parent Councils), staff and a representative of the Catholic Church. A range of views were shared. However, there was no consensus, with stakeholders' views polarised into those strongly in favour of change and those strongly against change. Staff recognised their sensitive position and have supported parents individually

and collectively to participate in the consultation process. Almost all staff took a neutral stance, however, a few were in favour of change and a few against. Around half of the parents, children and young people who met HM Inspectors felt that if option three was accepted then the education for young people would more accurately reflect the world of further and higher education and work as well as the community in which they live.

- 3.3 Children and young people who met with HM Inspectors had mixed views with around half in favour of Notre Dame High School being fully inclusive reflecting society at large with a mix of genders as well as cultures and backgrounds, including gender. A few children argued that if single gender education is appropriate, the Council should make a similar opportunity available to boys in Glasgow. Most young people do not think that girls and boys learn in different ways. However, learners currently attending Notre Dame High School believe that single gender education prepares them well as confident individuals.
- 3.4 Around half of the stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors believe that girls are succeeding better in science, technology, engineering and maths (STEM). Other stakeholders have argued that subject choice in Notre Dame High School is more limited in technology than other schools nearby.
- 3.5 Around half of the parents and young people responding to the consultation thought it important for young people themselves, and also to strengthen parental engagement, to have improved access to a local school in their community. They feel that the current situation creates a scattering of local young people to too many different schools. Added to this, a few parents talked about the additional stress on children and families who faced uncertainty in trying to get a placement request for a local school. They saw as a solution each school with its well-defined catchment including places for all local children. A few parents and children expressed concerns over environmental issues, arguing that a higher percentage of local young people attending Notre Dame High School would encourage greater numbers to walk or cycle to school with gains to the environment and health and wellbeing. Children and families talked about the practical difficulties faced by having siblings, boys and girls, attending different high schools and of the importance of having mixed gender peer groups for friendship and support.
- 3.6 The Archdiocese of Glasgow reported that it is grateful to Glasgow City Council for undertaking the school consultation to consider the future of Notre Dame High School. The Archdiocese regard the principle of parental choice to be paramount. They acknowledge the contribution made to Catholic education since the establishment of Notre Dame High School and value the high standards they judge to have been offered to the girls attending over time. Taking account of the aims and objectives within the Charter for Catholic Schools in Scotland, the Archdiocese is passionate in supporting the future growth and development of Catholic education in Glasgow. Whatever the outcome of the consultation, the church is keen to support inclusive schools with a distinct Catholic ethos.

#### **4. Summary**

Stakeholder groups and individuals hold strong and varied views about the relative merits of the different options. Children, young people and parents have deep-seated views which are mainly polarised into supporting the status quo or supporting a change which will see Notre Dame High School enrol both boys and girls in the future. A much smaller percentage favoured increasing the catchment area to include higher numbers of local girls (option two). HM Inspectors have not been provided with convincing evidence to support the claim that girls are attaining better or indeed worse in a single sex environment. There is potential for improvements in terms of planning for transition, parental engagement and reducing travel across the city, should option three be accepted. Currently, the educational benefits outlined by the Council do not present a compelling case for any of the three options. In finalising its report, it is important that the Council's educational benefits statement demonstrates clearly how the Council has identified and intends to balance the diverse interests and views expressed. The Council should continue to work closely with all stakeholders and give consideration to all evidence available when considering which option to take forward.

HM Inspectors August 2019