

**MINUTES**  
**OF**  
**GLASGOW CITY COUNCIL.**

Glasgow, 16th May 2019.

**Glasgow City Council.**

Present: The Lord Provost, Eva Bolander (Chair).

SAQIB AHMED	STEPHEN DORNAN	ELAINE McSPORRAN
ADE AIBINU	GLENN ELDER	ANNE McTAGGART
SUSAN AITKEN	MICHELLE FERNS	MAGGIE McTERNAN
KEN ANDREW	MARIE GARRITY	HANZALA MALIK
MALCOLM BALFOUR	ALLAN GOW	CHRISTY MEARNS-MACLEOD
ELAINE BALLANTYNE	ARCHIE GRAHAM	DAVID MEIKLE
DR MARTIN BARTOS	GARY GRAY	ANGUS MILLAR
ALEXANDER BELIC	GREG HEPBURN	JON MOLYNEUX
RICHARD BELL	MHAIRI HUNTER	ROBERT MOONEY
EUAN BLOCKLEY	RASHID HUSSAIN	JANE MORGAN
PHILIP BRAAT	JOHN KANE	MANDY MORGAN
BILL BUTLER	JIM KAVANAGH	MARGARET MORGAN
GRAHAM CAMPBELL	RUAIRI KELLY	EVA MURRAY
CHRISTINA CANNON	ELSPETH KERR	CECILIA O'LONE
ALLAN CASEY	MATT KERR	HANIF RAJA
PHILLIP CHARLES	THOMAS KERR	MARTIN RHODES
ANNETTE CHRISTIE	JENNIFER LAYDEN	ANNA RICHARDSON
ROBERT CONNELLY	JOHN LETFORD	RUSSELL ROBERTSON
MICHAEL CULLEN	KIM LONG	FRANNY SCALLY
MALCOLM CUNNING	FRANK McAVEETY	JAMES SCANLON
CHRIS CUNNINGHAM	DAVID McDONALD	SORYIA SIDDIQUE
STEPHEN CURRAN	ELAINE McDOUGALL	RHIANNON SPEAR
TONY CURTIS	MARTIN McELROY	KYLE THORNTON
FEARGAL DALTON	AILEEN McKENZIE	MARTHA WARDROP
FRANK DOCHERTY	JACQUELINE McLAREN	ALEX WILSON
JOSEPHINE DOCHERTY	KENNY McLEAN	TANYA WISELY
LAURA DOHERTY	NORMAN MacLEOD	ALLAN YOUNG

DEACON CONVENER

LORD DEAN OF GUILD

Apologies: Maureen Burke and Paul Carey.

Attending: C Forrest, Director of Governance and Solicitor to the Council;  
A O'Donnell, Chief Executive; G Gillespie, Executive Director of  
Neighbourhoods and Sustainability; M Johnston, Director of Financial  
and Business Services; D McClelland (for the Executive Director of

Education Services); and D Williams, Chief Officer, Glasgow City Health and Social Care Partnership.

### **Worldwide fatalities.**

1 The Lord Provost referred to the recent loss of life in Christchurch, New Zealand, Sri Lanka and countries worldwide that had suffered from atrocities and extended the House's condolences to those families who had suffered loss.

The House stood in silence as a mark of respect.

### **Lord Dean of Guild – Welcome.**

2 The Lord Provost welcomed to the House, Mr Alasdair Ronald, who had been elected as Lord Dean of Guild for the ensuing year, and expressed the hope that he would enjoy the ancient association of this House with the Merchants House of Glasgow during his term of office. Mr Ronald replied in suitable terms.

### **Minutes approved.**

3 The minutes of the Council meeting of 4th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 1 to 11) were submitted and approved.

### **Minutes of committees submitted and approved.**

4 The minutes of the undernoted committees were submitted and approved:-

(1) Planning Applications Committee of 9th and 23rd April 2019 (Print 1, pages 12 to 13);

(2) Scrutiny Committees:-

(a) Finance and Audit of 10th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 14 to 15); and

(b) Operational Performance and Delivery of 27th March and 24th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 16 to 18);

(3) Public Processions Committee of 16th and 24th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 19 to 20);

(4) City Policy Committees:-

(a) General Purposes of 16th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 21 to 22);

(b) Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and Citizen Engagement of 18th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 23 to 25);

- (c) Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm of 23rd April 2019 (Print 1, pages 26 to 29);
  - (d) Education, Skills and Early Years of 25th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 30 to 32); and
  - (d) Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction of 30th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 33 to 35);
- (6) Planning Local Review Committee of 2nd, 16th and 30th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 36 to 37);
  - (7) Personnel Appeals Committee of 26th March and 2nd, 17th and 30th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 38 to 39);
  - (8) Licensing and Regulatory Committee of 27th and 28th March and 10th, 11th, 17th, 24th and 25th April and 1st May 2019 (Print 1, pages 40 to 62);
  - (9) Contracts and Property Committee of 11th April and 2nd May 2019 (Print 1, pages 63 to 67); and
  - (10) City Administration Committee of 4th and 18th April 2019 (Print 1, pages 68 to 74).

**Revised conference and travel approval arrangements approved.**

**5** There was submitted a report by Councillor Letford, Council Business Manager and City Convener for Democratic Renewal, seeking approval to amend the approval arrangements for elected members' travel and/or attendance at conferences etc, advising that

- (1) at the meeting of the Business Bureau on 2nd April 2019, it was unanimously agreed to recommend approval of amended approval arrangements for elected members' travel and/or attendance at conferences etc;
- (2) it was proposed that the cost limit by which approval of conference attendance in the UK could be given by the Chief Executive, in consultation with the Council Business Manager, be increased to £800 per person to take account of the rising costs as well as enabling conferences to be booked more timeously, which could increase cost effectiveness;
- (3) it was also proposed that the Chief Executive, in consultation with the Council Business Manager, be authorised to approve international travel up to a maximum cost of £1,000 per person;
- (4) it was planned that a list of conference attendances and/or international travel approved in this way would be submitted to the Operational Performance and

Delivery Scrutiny Committee on a quarterly basis, as was currently the case for conference attendances; and

- (5) any conferences and/or international travel outwith these limits would continue to be submitted to the City Administration Committee for approval.

After consideration, the Council approved the amended approval arrangements for elected members' attendance at conferences and international travel and the consequential amendments to the Scheme of Delegated Functions.

### **Members' remuneration arrangements approved, after division.**

**6** With reference to the minutes of 18th May 2017 (Print 1, page 9) when it had been agreed to approve the salaries of senior councillors from May 2017, there was submitted a report by Councillor Letford, Council Business Manager and City Convener for Democratic Renewal, seeking approval for amendments to the structure and remuneration for certain senior councillor posts as well as taking account of the 2.8% increase in the budget for remuneration for 2019/20.

Councillor Letford, seconded by Councillor Aitken, moved that the Council approve the following proposals

- (1) that the Deputy Leader of the Council and City Convener for Communities be renamed as Deputy Leader and City Convener for Culture, Vibrancy and International Co-operation;
- (2) that the remuneration for the Deputy Leader of the Council and Council Business Manager and City Convener for Democratic Renewal be set at £38,500;
- (3) that the remuneration for the remaining City Convener posts be set at £33,000, with the exception of the City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration which should be set at £25,122;
- (4) that all Deputy City Convener posts be deleted and replaced with the Conveners of the City Policy Committees and the Convener of the Contracts and Property Committee, with the remuneration for these posts being set at £25,122;
- (5) that the City Convener for Equalities and Human Rights be renamed as City Convener for Community Empowerment, Equalities and Human Rights;
- (6) that the remuneration for the posts of Deputy Leader of the Opposition and Business Manager for the Opposition be removed;

- (7) to create the posts of Leader of the Opposition (Conservative Group) and Leader of the Opposition (Green Group), with the remuneration for those posts together with the Leader of the Majority Opposition (Labour Group) being set at £25,122;
- (8) to remunerate the positions of Convener of the Finance and Audit Scrutiny Committee and Convener of the Operational Performance and Delivery Scrutiny Committee at £25,122 each; and
- (9) to set remuneration for the post of Deputy Lord Provost at £29,421 and the posts of Convener of the Licensing and Regulatory Committee, Chair of the Licensing Board and Convener of the Planning Applications Committee at £25,122 each.

Councillor Butler, seconded by Councillor McAveety, moved as an amendment that the Council approve the proposals, with the exception of

- (a) the remuneration for the Depute Leader of the Council and the Council Business Manager and City Convener for Democratic Renewal, which should be set at £39,232;
- (b) the remuneration for the remaining City Convener posts, which should be set at £33,496, with the exception of the City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration, which should be set at £25,122;
- (c) the remuneration of Conveners of City Policy Committees, Scrutiny Committees and the Contracts and Property Committee, which should be set at £23,675; and
- (d) the remuneration of the Leader of the Opposition (Labour Group), which should be set at £29,421.

On a vote being taken electronically, 38 members voted for the amendment and 44 for the motion, which was accordingly declared to be carried, with the approved salaries of senior councillors being detailed in the appendix to these minutes.

### **Changes to committees approved etc.**

#### **7 The Council**

- (1) approved the following changes to committee:

*Committee etc*

*Appointment*

Appointment of Senior Officers

Revised membership:-

Committee	<p>Leader of the Council (Susan Aitken)  City Treasurer (Allan Gow)  City Convener for Workforce (Michelle Ferns)  Leader of the Opposition (Frank McAveety)  1 other majority opposition member (Marie Garrity)  1 Conservative Group nominee (Thomas Kerr)  1 Green Group nominee (Martha Wardrop),  with provision for substitutes</p>
Champions Board for Children and Young People	Remove Thomas Kerr and appoint Euan Blockley
City Administration Committee	Remove Robert Connelly as substitute and appoint Euan Blockley as substitute
Contracts and Property Committee	Remove Glenn Elder and Appoint John Leford
Education, Skills and Early Years City Policy Committee	Remove Feargal Dalton and appoint Susan Aitken
Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee	Remove Robert Connelly and Franny Scally and appoint Angus Millar (Convener) and Kyle Thornton.
General Purposes City Policy Committee	Remove Kyle Thornton and appoint Ade Aibinu
Local Licensing Forum	Appoint Mr Brian McNelis, Greater Glasgow Hotels Association
Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm City Policy Committee	Appoint Greg Hepburn as Convener in place of Elaine McSporran
Strathclyde Pension Fund Committee	Remove Euan Blockley, appoint David Meikle and appoint Ruairi Kelly as Vice Convener
Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and City Engagement City Policy Engagement	Remove Russell Robertson and appoint David McDonald

- (2) agreed that proposed changes to membership of the Planning Applications Committee be referred in the first instance to the Business Bureau for discussion at its next meeting.

### **Representation on outside bodies approved.**

**8** The Council approved the following changes to its representation on outside bodies:-

<i>Organisation</i>	<i>Change</i>
City Parking (Glasgow) LLP	Appoint Elaine McSporran as Chair in place of Alex Wilson
COSLA Convention	Remove David Meikle and appoint Thomas Kerr
COSLA Community Wellbeing Policy Board	Remove Russell Robertson as substitute and appoint David McDonald as substitute
Glasgow City Integration Joint Board	Remove Ade Aibinu and appoint Tony Curtis and and appoint Michelle Ferns as substitute
Glasgow Life (Culture and Sport Glasgow)	Remove Annette Christie and appoint Franny Scally
Linn Area Partnership	Appoint Margaret Morgan as Chair in place of Glenn Elder
Safe Glasgow Group	Appoint Franny Scally as Chair in place of Glenn Elder
SEEMIS LLP	Appoint Chris Cunningham and Mr David McClelland, Education Services

### **Correspondence - Letters from Roseanna Cunningham MSP and Michael Matheson MSP noted.**

**9** With reference to the minutes of 1st November 2018 (Print 1, pages 8 and 10) approving the terms of motions in respect of littering and a 20mph speed limit, there were submitted letters from Roseanna Cunningham MSP and Michael Matheson MSP in response to those motions.

### **Questions.**

**10** Answers to the following questions, of which notice had been given under Standing Order No 11, were given as undernoted:-

<i>Question</i>	<i>Questioner</i>	<i>Answered by</i>
Councillor Frank McAveety	“To ask the Leader of the Council if they agree with comments attributed to the Glasgow SNP that prompting members of their own party to share images from 2015 on twitter as ‘just a joke’?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Councillor Archie Graham	“To ask the Leader of the Council whether the Glasgow Airport Access proposal contained within the Connectivity Commission report will be taken forward in the development of a revised Outline Business Case?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Councillor Matt Kerr	“To ask the City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration the number of community care needs assessments carried out for asylum seekers in Glasgow in the last 12 months?”	Councillor Mhairi Hunter, City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration
Councillor Jane Morgan	“To ask the Leader of the Council to update the chamber on any conversations with the Scottish Government following the publication of the Connectivity Commission report?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Councillor Thomas Kerr	“To ask the Leader of the Council for her response to recent events which has seen the administration lose 2 Councillors and become even more of a minority administration?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Councillor Tony Curtis	“To ask the City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration with almost two thirds of people in Glasgow being overweight, and a quarter of the people of Glasgow being classed as obese, what is the city administration doing to reduce the precursors to, and prevalence of, obesity?”	Councillor Mhairi Hunter, City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration

Councillor Tanya Wisely	“In light of Scottish Government's Declaration of a Climate Emergency, will the Leader of the Council now support Green Councillors' call of February 2019 to put in place a £10.5 million budget to establish a Climate Emergency Fund in the current financial year?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Councillor Kim Long	“To ask the City Convener for Equalities to update the chamber on the first meeting and future plans for the new Asylum Strategic Forum?”	Councillor Jennifer Layden, City Convener for Equalities and Human Rights
Councillor Tanya Wisely	“To ask the relevant City Convener what engagement did the Council have with the Scottish Government's interim review of Regional Improvement Collaboratives?”	Councillor Chris Cunningham, City Convener for Education, Skills and Early Years
Councillor Euan Blockley	“Does the Leader of the Council agree with me that Sectarianism has no place in public office and that those that seek to represent this Council at a senior level should be careful with what they post online?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Councillor Mandy Morgan	“To ask the City Convener for Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm what progress the Council is making on its commitment to deliver new affordable homes?”	Councillor Kenny McLean, City Convener for Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm
Bailie Soryia Siddique	“To ask the City Convener for Education, Skills and Early Years to update the chamber on the governance arrangements in place to ensure that schools are able to maximise their use of Pupil Equity Funding.”	Councillor Chris Cunningham, City Convener for Education, Skills and Early Years
Councillor Alexander Belic	“Will the Leader of the Council join me in congratulating the Al-Farooq mosque in my ward which has just won Scottish Mosque of the Year?”	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth
Bailie Josephine Docherty	“Does the Leader agree that the Centenary of the 1919 “Battle of George Square” is an important part	Councillor Susan Aitken, Leader of the Council and City

of the people of Glasgow's heritage, and that it is right one of the main activists, John Maclean, was celebrated at this year's May Day rally?"

Convener for Inclusive  
Economic Growth

### **Suspension of Standing Order No 5(12) agreed.**

**11** The Council agreed to suspend the provisions of Standing Order No 5 (12) and that the House would not adjourn until the notice of motion at item 9(d) on the agenda had been dealt with.

### **Climate emergency – Motion, as adjusted, approved after division.**

**12** Councillor Richardson, seconded by Councillor Cullen, moved that

“Council records its full support for the decision of the First Minister to declare that there is a climate emergency. Council notes and endorses the First Minister's commitment to heed the science underpinning the declaration of a climate emergency, in particular the role of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, whose work is critical to understanding the drivers of climate change, its impacts, and future risks, and how adaptation and mitigation can reduce those risks.

Council welcomes the recent report by the UK Committee on Climate Change recommending a new target for the UK to achieve net-zero greenhouse gas emissions by 2050, and a net-zero emissions date for Scotland of 2045. Council further notes the committee's recommendation of new interim targets for Scotland of a 70% reduction by 2030 and 90% reduction, equivalent to carbon neutral, by 2040.

Cities must show leadership on climate change, and Council welcomes the progress already made in reducing Glasgow's carbon emissions, in particular that the city has already met and exceeded its carbon reduction target for the year 2020. Council notes that the city has achieved this through a wide-ranging set of actions, not only by the Council, but also by the citizens of the city, and other stakeholders, in key areas such as transport, energy efficiency and renewable energy.

Council understands that climate change is not just an environmental challenge, but is also a social justice issue, and that decisive and inclusive action now is essential to minimise the disproportionate impacts that climate change will have on our most vulnerable communities.

Council notes that the Strategic Plan approved by the Council in November 2017 sets a carbon neutral target for the city of 2037. Council welcomes the decision of the Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee

to establish a Climate Emergency Working Group, with all-party membership and representation from citizen activist groups, as well as the Chamber of Commerce.

Council resolves to declare a climate emergency and looks forward to receiving the report and recommendations of the Climate Emergency Working Group after the summer recess, recognises that these are likely to be radical and challenging for both the Council and the wider city, and commits to using these recommendations as the basis for delivering the decarbonisation of the city in response to this climate emergency.”

Councillor McTernan, seconded by Councillor Jane Morgan, moved as an amendment that

- (1) paragraph 1 of the motion be amended to replace the words from “Council records” to “commitment to” with:-

“Council notes the decision of the Scottish and Welsh Governments, the UK Parliament, and other UK cities such as London and Manchester who have declared a climate emergency. Council notes the commitment to”; and

- (2) the following be inserted after paragraph 5:-

“Council therefore believes that any future action plans to tackle the climate emergency should be treated with the utmost urgency. Council further believes that disastrous climate change could severely impact Glasgow’s communities, and therefore resolves to continue and accelerate its work to build the resilience of our communities in the face of such change.”

Bailie Thornton, seconded by Councillor Curtis, moved as an amendment that

- (a) the following be inserted between paragraphs 2 and 3 of the motion:-

“Council celebrates the UK’s recent achievement of a coal-free week, the first time in over 100 years that Britain went 7 days without using electricity from burning coal. Council recognises the commitment of the UK Government to tackling climate change and the UK’s positive record thus far, with total greenhouse gas emissions falling by 42% between 1990-2017. Council further welcomes the efforts of the UK Department for International Development in committing £5.8 billion worth of funding between 2016 and 2022 targeted at helping developing countries adapt to environmental challenges.”;

- (b) at paragraph 3 after “stakeholders” insert:-

“including private sector businesses”;

- (c) at the end of paragraph 3 add:-

“Council further notes the importance of the circular economy and our responsibility to use as few resources as possible, cut waste wherever

possible, and maximise reuse of products and recognises calls for public bodies to default to buying electric rather than fossil fuel vehicles. Council therefore commits to incorporating circular economic principles in procurement decisions and looks to defaulting to the purchase of electric vehicles wherever possible when replacing vehicle fleets.”;

(d) at paragraph 4 after “vulnerable communities” insert:-

“and will help avoid the need to pay higher adaptation costs in the future.”;  
and

(e) at paragraph 6 delete:-

“are likely to be radical and challenging for both the Council and the wider city”

and replace with:-

“will likely require cross-party support and innovative thinking from both the Council and the wider city”.

Councillor Wardrop, seconded by Councillor Wisely, moved as an amendment that

(i) the following be inserted as the first paragraph:-

“Council recognises and supports the recent Climate Strikes driven by Greta Thunberg and the Youth Climate Strikers, and their families in Glasgow and around the world who have demanded transformative action on Climate Change. Council acknowledges that Mark Ruskell MSP led a debate in the Scottish Parliament calling for a legislative ban on fracking and highlighting that a policy of maximum economic recovery of oil and gas is not compatible with addressing the climate emergency.”;

(ii) the following be inserted after the sentence ending “equivalent to carbon neutral, by 2040”:-

“Council notes the publication of the Summary Report of the Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and recognises that the Climate Emergency is intensified by the emerging global biodiversity crisis. Council recognises that while there is significant overlap between the Climate Emergency and this ecological emergency, particularly in the requirement for nature-based solutions, there are also distinct drivers and challenges around biodiversity that will need to be addressed.”;

(iii) the following additional sentence be inserted at the end of paragraph 3:-

“However, Council notes that we have to limit Global Warming to less than 1.5C and this will require significant accelerated effort with all partners across the city and region”.

- (iv) the following additional wording be inserted into the 4th paragraph after the words “social justice”:-

“and economic”;

- (v) the following be added at the end of the last paragraph:-

“here and is already having on vulnerable communities globally.”;

- (vi) the words “and ecological” be inserted in the final paragraph after the word “climate”; and

- (vii) the following additional paragraphs be added at the end of the current motion text:-

“Council resolves to put in place a Climate Emergency Fund in the current financial year to ensure that action on the forthcoming Climate Emergency Working Group recommendations can begin immediately.

Council resolves that subsequent to the recommendations of the Climate Emergency Working Group being submitted, a short-life process will be put in place to establish whether further recommendations are required to address the ecological emergency specifically.

Council notes that, in the face of the Climate Emergency, the International Monetary Fund and the Governor of the Bank of England have updated their advice on the financial risks involved, and the OECD have issued a report on the finance and business implications of the Biodiversity Crisis and instructs the Executive Director of Finance to bring a report to Finance and Audit Scrutiny Committee detailing the Council’s response to this new context including in relation to divestment from fossil fuels.

Council recognises that climate emergency requires a structural response and that unrestrained free market capitalism has caused the crisis so cannot be expected to fix it, therefore Council calls on banks, pension funds and government agencies to divest from fossil fuels, and instead demands massive public investment to drive a jobs-rich Green New Deal for Scotland.”

Councillor Richardson, with the approval of her seconder, accepted the amendment by Councillor McTernan and part of the amendment by Councillor Wardrop, resulting in the following adjusted motion:-

“Council recognises and supports the recent Climate Strikes driven by Greta Thunberg and the Youth Climate Strikers, and their families in Glasgow and around the world who have demanded transformative action on Climate Change. Council acknowledges that Mark Ruskell MSP led a debate in the Scottish Parliament calling for a legislative ban on fracking and highlighting that a policy of maximum economic recovery of oil and gas is not compatible with addressing the climate emergency.

Council notes the decision of the Scottish and Welsh Governments, the UK Parliament, and other UK cities such as London and Manchester who have declared a climate emergency. Council notes the commitment to heed the science underpinning the declaration of a climate emergency, in particular the role of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, whose work is critical to understanding the drivers of climate change, its impacts, and future risks, and how adaptation and mitigation can reduce those risks.

Council welcomes the recent report by the UK Committee on Climate Change recommending a new target for the UK to achieve net-zero greenhouse gas emissions by 2050, and a net-zero emissions date for Scotland of 2045. Council further notes the committee's recommendation of new interim targets for Scotland of a 70% reduction by 2030 and 90% reduction, equivalent to carbon neutral, by 2040.

Council notes the publication of the Summary Report of the Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and recognises that the Climate Emergency is intensified by the emerging global biodiversity crisis. Council recognises that while there is significant overlap between the Climate Emergency and this ecological emergency, particularly in the requirement for nature-based solutions, there are also distinct drivers and challenges around biodiversity that will need to be addressed.

Cities must show leadership on climate change, and Council welcomes the progress already made in reducing Glasgow's carbon emissions, in particular that the city has already met and exceeded its carbon reduction target for the year 2020. Council notes that the city has achieved this through a wide-ranging set of actions, not only by the Council, but also by the citizens of the city, and other stakeholders, in key areas such as transport, energy efficiency, and renewable energy. However, Council notes that we have to limit Global Warming to less than 1.5C and this will require significant accelerated effort with all partners across the city and region.

Council understands that climate change is not just an environmental challenge, but is also a social justice and economic issue, and that decisive and inclusive action now is essential to minimise the disproportionate impacts that climate change will have on our most vulnerable communities.

Council notes that the Strategic Plan approved by the Council in November 2017 sets a carbon neutral target for the city of 2037. Council welcomes the decision of the Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee to establish a Climate Emergency Working Group, with all-party membership and representation from citizen activist groups, as well as the Chamber of Commerce.

Council therefore believes that any future action plans to tackle the climate emergency should be treated with the utmost urgency. Council further believes that disastrous climate change could severely impact Glasgow's communities, and therefore resolves to continue and accelerate its work to build the resilience of our communities in the face of such change.

Council resolves to declare a climate and ecological emergency and looks forward to receiving the report and recommendations of the Climate Emergency Working Group after the summer recess, recognises that these are likely to be radical and challenging for both the Council and the wider city, and commits to using these recommendations as the basis for delivering the decarbonisation of the city in response to this climate emergency here and is already having on vulnerable communities globally.

Council resolves to identify additional revenue which demonstrates the Administration's commitment to put in place a Climate Emergency Fund in the current financial year to ensure that action on the forthcoming Climate Emergency Working Group recommendations can begin immediately.

Council resolves that subsequent to the recommendations of the Climate Emergency Working Group being submitted, a short-life process will be put in place to establish whether further recommendations are required to address the ecological emergency specifically.

Council notes that, in the face of the Climate Emergency, the International Monetary Fund and the Governor of the Bank of England have updated their advice on the financial risks involved, and the OECD have issued a report on the finance and business implications of the Biodiversity Crisis and instructs the Executive Director of Finance to bring a report to Finance and Audit Scrutiny Committee detailing the Council's response to this new context including in relation to divestment from fossil fuels."

On a vote being taken electronically 8 members voted for the amendment and 73 for the motion as adjusted, with 1 abstention.

The adjusted motion was accordingly declared to be carried.

### **Adjournment.**

**13** The Council, in terms of Standing Order No 17, agreed to adjourn the meeting at 1525 hours for 10 minutes.

### **Resumption of meeting.**

**14** The meeting resumed at 1535 hours and the sederunt was taken as follows:-

Present: The Lord Provost, Eva Bolander (Chair).

SAQIB AHMED  
ADE AIBINU  
SUSAN AITKEN  
KEN ANDREW  
MALCOLM BALFOUR

STEPHEN DORNAN  
GLENN ELDER  
MICHELLE FERNS  
MARIE GARRITY  
ALLAN GOW

ELAINE McSPORRAN  
ANNE McTAGGART  
MAGGIE McTERNAN  
HANZALA MALIK  
CHRISTY MEARNS-MACLEOD

ELAINE BALLANTYNE  
DR MARTIN BARTOS  
ALEXANDER BELIC  
RICHARD BELL  
EUAN BLOCKLEY  
PHILIP BRAAT  
BILL BUTLER  
GRAHAM CAMPBELL  
CHRISTINA CANNON  
ALLAN CASEY  
PHILLIP CHARLES  
ANNETTE CHRISTIE  
ROBERT CONNELLY  
MICHAEL CULLEN  
MALCOLM CUNNING  
CHRIS CUNNINGHAM  
STEPHEN CURRAN  
TONY CURTIS  
FEARGAL DALTON  
FRANK DOCHERTY  
JOSEPHINE DOCHERTY  
LAURA DOHERTY

ARCHIE GRAHAM  
GARY GRAY  
GREG HEPBURN  
MHAIRI HUNTER  
RASHID HUSSAIN  
JOHN KANE  
JIM KAVANAGH  
RUAIRI KELLY  
ELSPETH KERR  
MATT KERR  
THOMAS KERR  
JENNIFER LAYDEN  
JOHN LETFORD  
KIM LONG  
FRANK McAVEETY  
DAVID McDONALD  
ELAINE McDOUGALL  
MARTIN McELROY  
AILEEN McKENZIE  
JACQUELINE McLAREN  
KENNY McLEAN  
NORMAN MacLEOD

DAVID MEIKLE  
ANGUS MILLAR  
JON MOLYNEUX  
ROBERT MOONEY  
JANE MORGAN  
MANDY MORGAN  
MARGARET MORGAN  
EVA MURRAY  
CECILIA O'LONE  
HANIF RAJA  
MARTIN RHODES  
ANNA RICHARDSON  
RUSSELL ROBERTSON  
FRANNY SCALLY  
JAMES SCANLON  
SORYIA SIDDIQUE  
RHIANNON SPEAR  
KYLE THORNTON  
MARTHA WARDROP  
ALEX WILSON  
TANYA WISELY  
ALLAN YOUNG

DEACON CONVENER

LORD DEAN OF GUILD

Apologies: Maureen Burke and Paul Carey.

Attending: C Forrest, Director of Governance and Solicitor to the Council; A O'Donnell, Chief Executive; G Gillespie, Executive Director of Neighbourhoods and Sustainability; M Johnston, Director of Financial and Business Services; D McClelland (for the Executive Director of Education Services); and D Williams, Chief Officer, Glasgow City Health and Social Care Partnership.

### **Mary Barbour law – Motion dealt with, after division.**

**15** Councillor McDougall, seconded by Bailie Kane, moved that

“Council notes the announcement by Richard Leonard MSP, Leader of the Scottish Labour Party, and Pauline McNeill MSP, an elected representative of this city, for a ‘Mary Barbour Law’ to help solve Scotland’s Housing Crisis. Such a law would empower residents in the ever expanding Private Rented Sector and help to control unaffordable rent increases by linking increases in rents to improvements in standards.

Council further notes that Mary Barbour, a former Bailie of this city, was a leader of the famous Rent Strikes in 1915 which led to the Rents and Mortgage Interest Restriction Act of that same year.

Council believes that a Mary Barbour Law is necessary given the increase in the Private Rented Sector in Glasgow, which has more than doubled since 2001, and that increases in rents have outstripped increases in wages, pushing higher the cost of living for young adults and families with children, who constitute the majority of tenants in the Private Rented Sector.

Council welcomes recent increases in funding available for house building in Glasgow in future years, after successive budgets which constrained the ability to meet demand for new socially rented and mid-market rent housing. However, it also recognises that this increase in funding is a response to the emerging housing crisis that is taking place in the country.

Council therefore resolves to support calls for a Mary Barbour Law and Pauline McNeill MSP's proposed Members' Bill, and instructs the Chief Executive to write to Ms McNeill outlining the Council's support for her Members' Bill."

Councillor McLean, seconded by Councillor Kelly, moved as an amendment that:-

"Council notes Glasgow's history of fighting for the right to decent housing and recognises the contribution of Mary Barbour, a former Bailie of this city, leader of the rent strikes of 1915 and campaigner for improved housing and social conditions for working people.

Council therefore welcomes the ongoing efforts to develop Rent Pressure Zones in Glasgow, following the unanimously agreed motion in September 2017 and report to the City Policy Committee last year, recognises housing supply as a key factor in providing quality affordable housing and welcomes the Scottish Government's More Homes national target of 50,000 affordable homes, of which 35,000 will be for social rent, and the resources made available to Glasgow over the next 5 years, which could deliver 8,464 affordable homes based on £557.182m investment funding, identified in the Strategic Housing Investment Plan.

Council also welcomes the research conducted by academics on behalf of Shelter Scotland which reviewed the use of rent controls across Europe and which identified possible different models and agrees this should inform and support initiatives and programmes being made by Glasgow City Council; working in partnership with the Scottish Government, registered social landlords and others to develop affordable and social housing in the City and Scotland.

Council applauds these efforts and initiatives, and agrees with the University of York Centre for Housing Policy report that radical change to the law relating to the Private Rented Sector occurred in Scotland after a 2-year consultation period, which involved an extended group of stakeholders in a programme of consensus-building. This provides a 'road map' of required interventions; welcomes the

insights provided by recent research and agrees that current and planned programmes should continue this radical approach.”

Councillor Thomas Kerr, seconded by Bailie Aibinu, moved as an amendment that:-

“Council notes proposals for rent controls within private rented properties. Council believes that such rent controls would lead to a lack of investment into private rented properties as well as a likely reduction in the supply of such homes for rent. As such, this proposal has the potential to intensify housing issues within Glasgow by reducing the quality and quantity of private rented homes.

Council therefore resolves not to support the Members’ Bill being put forward by Pauline McNeill MSP with such proposals.

Council believes that we must have a housing market with a sufficient mixture of homes for purchase and for private and social rent. Council notes its role as a Planning Authority in ensuring appropriate building of homes in Glasgow and its role as the owner of a number of brownfield sites which could be made available for the building of homes. Council resolves that it will work to support increasing the supply of a mixture of home tenures to allow Glasgow’s citizens to choose the type of home tenure which would suit them best.”

Bailie Mearns-Macleod, seconded by Councillor Molyneux, moved as an amendment that the following be inserted after the words “Council therefore resolves to support calls for a Mary Barbour Law and Pauline McNeill MSP's proposed Members' Bill”:-

“as well as calls from Green MSPs to:

- address insecurity in the private-rented sector by reviewing the grounds for eviction in the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016 so that no tenant is evicted on no-fault grounds;
- reconsider the steps and evidence required from Councils to implement a Rent Pressure Zone, as detailed in the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016, as this is unnecessarily burdensome and has stalled any progress on introducing RPZs;
- consider additional provision within the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016 which would instead require landlords to submit rent increase information;
- re-explore options around introducing a Land Value Tax to unlock additional local revenue and bring down the cost of land and housing.

In addition, Council resolves to support Green MSP, Andy Wightman’s, amendment to the Planning Bill which would free up homes by giving Councils the power to require “Change of Use” planning permission before entire homes could be let out on a short-term basis.”

Councillor McDougall, with the approval of her seconder, accepted the amendment by Bailie Mearns-Macleod.

On a vote being taken electronically, 37 members voted for the amendment by Councillor McLean, 8 for the amendment by Councillor Thomas Kerr and 36 for the motion as adjusted.

As none of the proposals had received the support of a majority of the members voting, the amendment by Councillor Kerr, having received the fewest votes, was dropped and a further vote was taken on the remaining proposals when 37 members voted for the amendment by Councillor McLean and 36 for the motion as adjusted, with 8 absentions. The amendment by Councillor McLean was accordingly declared to be carried.

### **P1 testing – Motion approved, after division.**

**16** Councillor Blockley, seconded by Bailie Thornton, moved that

“Council believes that good quality assessment is an essential tool assisting teachers to improve education standards and understands that there exists a variety of different methods available to meet statutory requirements.

Council notes however the significant concerns raised in recent months by parents, teachers, and education professionals regarding the use of Scottish National Standardised Assessments (SNSAs) at the Primary 1 stage. Council further recognises the votes of both MSPs and Glasgow City Councillors last year which clearly set out the opposition of the Scottish Parliament and this Council to SNSAs at Primary 1.

Council regrets that, like his Scottish Government counterpart, the current Education Convener has disrespected the position of Elected Members on this matter. Council confirms that the current SNP administration is in a minority position and considers its attempt to defy the majority vote of Glasgow City Councillors as unacceptable.

Council recognises the Scottish Parliament vote against this testing in Primary 1 and the subsequent will of Councillors, who voted based on clear and concise information as to whether Primary 1 tests are in line with the play-based learning philosophy of the early years provision in the Curriculum for Excellence.

Council therefore instructs the Executive Director of Education to write to all head teachers in Glasgow advising them that this Council fully supports them when they choose not to use the SNSAs at Primary 1 stage.

Council further resolves that the City Convener for Education, Skills and Early Years has lost the confidence of the Council.

Councillor Cunningham, seconded by Councillor Bell, moved as an amendment

“This Council welcomes the recent Education Scotland inspection report which highlighted Glasgow’s success in improving learning, raising attainment and achievement across the city and making excellent progress in closing the national poverty related attainment gap.

The report – one of 9 Attainment Challenge Local Authority inspections carried out in Scotland - is a huge accolade for Glasgow’s schools, young people, teachers and school staff and recognition of the commitment, dedication and the ‘relentless drive to reduce the impact of poverty on the outcomes of all children and young people’ in the city.

Council notes that education inspectors highlighted a number of key strengths including, a very strong council-wide vision focused on reducing the impact of poverty on children, families and communities, clear leadership from elected members and relentless drive from the Executive Director to improving the educational outcomes, and outstanding approach to career-long professional learning strengthening the skills and knowledge of staff and, as a result improved children’s and young people’s attainment.

Council welcomes the fact that Glasgow’s attainment, achievement, attendance and positive destination figures are the highest they have ever been.

Within this context, Council recognises that good quality assessment is an essential tool in assisting teachers to improve education standards and understands that there exists a variety of different approaches to assessment, only one of which is the Scottish National Standardised Assessment (SNSAs).

Council further recognises that head teachers have the professional autonomy to make their own judgement on the value of the assessments and therefore fully supports them in any choice they make to either implement or not implement the SNSAs at Primary 1 stage.

Council instructs the Executive Director of Education to write to all primary head teachers accordingly.”

Councillor Wisely, seconded by Councillor Molyneux, moved as an amendment that

(1) the following be added to the end of paragraph 5 of the motion:-

“highlighting the Council’s belief that the SNSA tests are not compatible with the play-based learning philosophy of the early years. The letter should also advise that, if head teachers do choose to use the tests at the Primary 1 stage, this Council supports them when they agree to any request from parents or carers wishing to withdraw their children from those tests.”; and

(2) the following be added at the end of paragraph 6:-

“and therefore instructs them to report to the Education, Skills and Early Years City Policy Committee, or another appropriate Committee, within the next

meeting cycle, setting out how they will give effect to the settled will of the Council as expressed today.”

Councillor Blockley, with the approval of his seconder, accepted the amendment by Councillor Wisely.

On a vote being taken electronically 37 members voted for the amendment by Councillor Cunningham and 44 for the adjusted motion by Councillor Blockley, which was accordingly declared to be carried.

### **Connectivity Commission proposals - Motion approved.**

**17** Bailie Dr Bartos, seconded by Bailie Mearns-Macleod, moved that

“Council notes the release of the Phase 2 Connectivity Commission report initiated by the Leader of Glasgow City Council. Council thanks the Commissioners, those organisations called upon to provide evidence as well as the staff and campaigners within the transport field who daily work hard to deliver better public transport in the west of Scotland. Council believes that bold and ambitious investment in transport has the potential to transform the economy of Glasgow and the West of Scotland and delivery of this will require collaboration and coordination across different agencies responsible for transport and planning.

Council believes in the importance of an ecologically and economically sustainable, integrated multi-modal public transport network which is safe, accessible and affordable to serve the needs of people across this and nearby regional authorities. Council believes that this vision cannot be achieved without public direction and adequate funding across the whole travel-to-work region and notes the Commission’s case for £10billion investment in transport. Council believes responsible investment in low and carbon-neutral transport is key to empowering people and protecting the planet given the climate emergency.

Council notes the Commission’s reference to a range of transport funding mechanisms employed elsewhere and believes that such ideas should be explored further. Council notes that transport funding does not simply require capital money but also additional revenue support. Council therefore calls on MSPs to look at the funding of regional planning and transport bodies and to consider appropriate amendments to the Planning and Transport Bills or other legislation where required to empower them across Scotland to develop tailored mechanisms for revenue raising which adapt any of the methods referenced in the report, subject to local and regional democratic accountability and oversight.

Council believes that Glasgow should receive additional central government transport funding for use and decision at a local/regional level, recognising the city’s size and key regional impact on commerce, education and healthcare and the transport challenges which this does bring. Council believes large capital projects will require regional coordination of a funding package delivered jointly by local authorities, Scottish and UK government. Council believes it is vital that

we learn lessons from past attempts to improve city transportation with a view to avoiding rocketing costs and manage unrealistic expectations.

Council believes that good governance in regional transport and planning requires good democratic input and oversight. To do this for transport requires a broad elected-membership drawn from the travel to work area and a track record of good engagement with all stakeholders. Council believes that such a statutorily established governance model already exists through regional transport partnerships but that additional powers and fresh models for delivery and working should be considered. Council further notes that there is both ongoing work relating to roles and responsibilities with the National Transport Strategy review and ongoing local governance review by Scottish Government with COSLA.

Council welcomes the revival of a range of ambitious transport suggestions, including recognition of the need for funding and delivery of a crossrail connectivity project for Glasgow, noting this would benefit people and businesses across the wider region.

Council notes the Commission's preferred Central/Queen Street Station Crossrail Tunnel option and believes it would be important to compare the social, economic and carbon reduction benefits of a fully assessed Glasgow Crossrail Tunnel option with overground Glasgow Crossrail proposals based on redevelopment of an existing under-utilised line.

Council notes the decision of the Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee to consider a report on the Commission's findings. In order to better understand the above projects Council instructs officers to collate and provide to the Committee all available work carried out so far, seeking any business cases used in support of project consideration by the Commission or other relevant information available on the transport challenges raised, in order that the Committee and public can consider the evidence. In order to maintain momentum on the report's wide-ranging ambition for transformative change, Council resolves to establish a Transport Delivery Steering Group, comprised of elected members representing all groups, to oversee the Council's progress in delivering or facilitating work around the transport projects contained, as well as those which arise from the Regional Transport Strategy. Council instructs officers to invite the Connectivity Commission's Chair, or Vice-chair, to attend any Council Committees considering their project proposals.

Council looks forward to hearing from the other local authorities in the regional travel-to-work area regarding their reaction to the report and future transport funding arrangements."

Councillor Aitken, seconded by Councillor Millar, moved as an amendment that

"Council notes the publication of the Phase 2 Connectivity Commission report initiated by the Leader of Glasgow City Council. Council thanks the Commissioners, the organisations called upon to provide evidence and the staff

and campaigners within the transport field who daily work hard to deliver better public transport in the west of Scotland. Council believes that the Commission has delivered a bold and ambitious package of recommendations with the potential to transform the economy of the Glasgow region and notes that this will require collaboration and coordination across different agencies responsible for transport planning.

Council believes in the importance of an ecologically and economically sustainable, integrated multi-modal public transport network which is safe, accessible and affordable to serve the needs of people across this and nearby regional authorities. Council believes that this vision cannot be achieved without public direction and adequate funding across the whole travel-to-work region and notes the Commission's case for £10billion investment in transport. Council believes responsible investment in low and carbon-neutral transport is key to empowering people and protecting the planet given the climate emergency.

Council notes the Commission's reference to a range of transport funding mechanisms employed elsewhere and believes that such powers, including precept, may be necessary as part of a funding package delivered jointly by the local authorities within the Strathclyde area, Scottish Government and UK Government, supported by appropriate legislation where required.

Council welcomes the revival of a range of ambitious transport suggestions, including recognition of the need for funding and delivery of a crossrail connectivity project for Glasgow, noting this would benefit people and businesses across the wider region.

Council believes that good governance in regional transport and planning requires good democratic input and oversight. To do this for transport requires a broad elected-membership drawn from the travel-to-work area. Council agrees that new models and powers will be required in order to deliver effective governance at a regional and local level and that cross-party democratic accountability will be a fundamental consideration in any new structures.

Council notes the decision of the Environment Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee to consider a report on the Commission's findings. In order to better understand the above projects, Council instructs officers to: invite the Connectivity Commission's Chair, or Vice-chair, to attend any Council Committees considering these transport project proposals; and to collate and provide to the Committee available work carried out so far to support future delivery of these projects.

Council looks forward to hearing from Scottish Government and other local authorities in the travel-to-work area regarding their reaction to the report and future transport funding arrangements".

Councillor McAveety, seconded by Councillor Butler, moved as an amendment to insert at the end:-

“Council resolves to establish a delivery group, comprised of elected members, to oversee the Council’s progress in delivering around projects contained within this wide-ranging and ambitious report.”

Bailie Thornton, seconded by Councillor Connelly, moved as an amendment to delete paragraph 3 and replace with:-

“Council notes the Commission’s reference to a range of transport funding mechanisms employed elsewhere and believes that such ideas should be explored further – including looking at the funding of regional planning and transport bodies. Council believes that Glasgow should receive additional central funding for use and decision at a local/regional level in line with the city’s size as a centre of commerce, education and healthcare and the transport challenges which this can bring. Council believes it is vital that we learn lessons from past attempts to improve city transportation with a view to avoid rocketing costs and manage unrealistic expectations.”

During the debate Councillors Aitken and McAveety and Bailie Thornton, with the agreement of their seconders, withdrew their amendments in favour of the motion.

The Council approved unanimously.

## **Adjournment.**

**18** In terms of Standing Order No 5 (12), the time being after 1700 hours, the Council agreed to adjourn the meeting at 1800 hours, the remaining items of business being 9(f) and 9(g), having noted that the motion by Councillor Spear at item 9(e) had been withdrawn.

## **APPENDIX**

### **Senior Councillors’ Allowances 2019/20**

<i>Post</i>	<i>Remuneration</i>
1 Depute Leader of the Council and City Convener for Culture, Vibrancy and International Co-operation	£38,500
2 Council Business Manager and City Convener for Democratic Renewal	£38,500
3 Depute Lord Provost	£29,421
4 City Treasurer	£33,000
5 City Convener for Community Empowerment, Equalities and Human Rights	£33,000
6 City Convener for Education, Skills and Early Years	£33,000
7 City Convener for Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm	£33,000
8 City Convener for Sustainability and Carbon Reduction	£33,000
9 City Convener for Workforce	£33,000
10 City Convener for Health and Social Care Integration	£25,122
11 Convener of Education, Skills and Early Years City Policy	£25,122

Committee	
12 Convener of Environment, Sustainability and Carbon Reduction City Policy Committee	£25,122
13 Convener of General Purposes City Policy Committee	£25,122
14 Convener of Neighbourhoods, Housing and Public Realm City Policy Committee	£25,122
15 Convener of Wellbeing, Empowerment, Community and Citizen Engagement City Policy Committee	£25,122
16 Convener of Contracts and Property Committee	£25,122
17 Convener of Licensing and Regulatory Committee	£25,122
18 Convener of Planning Applications Committee	£25,122
19 Convener of Finance and Audit Scrutiny Committee	£25,122
20 Convener of Operational Performance and Delivery Scrutiny Committee	£25,122
21 Chair of Licensing Board	£25,122
22 Leader of the Opposition (Labour Group)	£25,122
23 Leader of the Opposition (Conservative Group)	£25,122
24 Leader of the Opposition (Green Group)	£25,122
<b>Total (Count 24)</b>	<b>£681,251</b>

**Total budget available (maximum 24) £681,360**

#### **Senior Councillors Maximum 24 (Excluding Leader and Civic Head)**

Leader of the Council and City Convener for Inclusive Economic Growth	£52,414
Civic Head (Lord Provost)	£39,310
<b>Leader and Civic Head Total</b>	<b>£91,724</b>

Note remuneration for Leader and Civic Head is as set out in the Local Governance (Scotland) Act 2004 (Remuneration) Amendment Regulations 2019.

#### **Adjournment.**

**18** In terms of Standing Order No 5 (12), the time being after 1700 hours, the Council agreed to adjourn the meeting at 1800 hours, the remaining items of business being 9(f) and 9(g), having noted that the motion by Councillor Spear at item 9(e) had been withdrawn.

#### **Adjournment.**

**19** In terms of Standing Order No 5 (12), the time being after 1700 hours, the Council agreed to adjourn the meeting at 1800 hours, the remaining items of business being 9(g), having noted that the motion by Councillor Spear at item 9(e) had been withdrawn.